

Reference ID	Title	Authors	Year	Journal or Conference name	Vol.	No.	Research topic	Concrete security patterns	Concrete misuse/threat/attacks	Relationships among patterns	Characteristics	Vulnerability and threats addressed	Quality Measurement	Pattern modeling /description notation	Intended dev. Methodology	Evaluation	Phase/lifecycle stage	Tooling/automation	Platform dependence	
4	A collaborative process for developing secure component based applications	Bouaziz R, Kalleh S, Gouletta B	2014	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Pattern integration	Authorization, authentication, RBAC		N/A		N/A	N/A	UML	Model driven methodology	Example			EJB platform	
5	A comparative study of software security pattern classifications	Ali A.K, Zulkernine M	2012	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Classification, Catalog, Map	N/A	N/A	N/A		Threat modeling	Classification quality metrics	N/A	N/A	N/A	Any	N/A	N/A	
6	A comprehensive pattern-driven security methodology for distributed systems	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2014	Proceedings of the Australian Software Engineering Conference, ASWEC			Development methodology	Authorization, authentication, RBAC		Yes	Unclear	Unclear	N/A	UML-like	N/A	Example	Requirements analysis/design	N/A	N/A	
7	A comprehensive pattern-oriented approach to engineering security methodologies	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2015	Inf Softw Technol			Development methodology	N/A	N/A	Yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	pattern language	methodology engineering	None	All	N/A	N/A	
8	A decision support map for security patterns application	Bouaziz R, Kamoun S	2015	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)	9158		Classification, Catalog, Map	N/A	N/A	Yes	Confidentiality, availability	N/A	N/A	UML, aspect template	UML, aspect template	Example	Analysis, Design, Implementation	N/A	N/A	
9	A framework for exploiting security expertise in application development	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2006	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Knowledge base and repository	None	Yes	Yes	Confidentiality, Availability	None	None	Ontology	None	None	All	Ontology query language	Not specified	
10	A framework for security driven software evolution	Guan H, Wang X, Yang H	2014	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Knowledge base and repository	None	No	No	Not Specified	CVSS	None	OWL	MDD	None	Reengineering, Evolution	MDA, Protégé, OWL API	Legacy systems	
11	A method for web security control patterns development from user interface definition based on structural and textual inputs	Singapuri P, Prasad N	2015	Lecture Notes in Electrical Engineering	339		Pattern extraction	TLS indicator	phishing	y			No	UML class diagram	N/A	simple example	UI design	No	No	
12	A methodology for integrating access control policies within database development	Bouaziz R, Kalleh S, Gouletta B	2012	Computers and Security	31	3	Development methodology	RBAC (as an example)	N/A	No	Confidentiality, Integrity		N/A	UML + OCL	MDD	simple case study	design and implementation	UML, Protégé, OWL API	N/A	
13	A methodology for mining security tactics from security patterns	Rajeev J, Lakshmi R, Kamoun S	2010	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Pattern extraction	Authenticator		Yes	Reusing, Degrading, Reconfiguring	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Example	architecture design	N/A	N/A	
14	A methodology to develop secure systems using patterns	Bouaziz R, Kalleh S, Gouletta B	2006	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Development methodology	analysis patterns/RBAC patterns		Yes	Confidentiality	N/A	N/A	UML	N/A	N/A	Requirements analysis, design and implementation	N/A	general	
15	A modeling and formal approach for the precise specification of security patterns	Hamid B, Percebois C	2014	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Specification	Secure Communication Patterns		Yes	Confidentiality	N/A	N/A	Original Protocol Specification	N/A	N/A	Design	Verification Tool	N/A	
16	A multi-dimensional classification for users of security patterns	Narain M, Prasad N, Singh R	2009	Journal of Research and Practice in Information Technology	41	2	Classification, Catalog, Map	N/A	N/A	No	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
17	A natural classification scheme for software security patterns	Ali A.K, Zulkernine M	2011	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Classification, Catalog, Map	N/A	N/A	Yes	CIA + accountability	Yes	N/A	UML, natural language	N/A	N/A	Requirements, design, implementation	N/A	N/A	
18	A novel approach for the development and deployment of security patterns	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2010	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Application	N/A	no	no	availability	Yes	n/a	UML, natural language	N/A	no	design, requirement	no	no	
19	A pattern based approach for secure database design	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2011	Lecture Notes in Business Information Processing	31	100	Application	Authorization, RBAC	N/A	No	Confidentiality	Unauthorized access and use	N/A	UML with CCL	N/A	None	Design, Implements		N/A	
20	A pattern-based general security framework : AAAAn ebusiness case study	Bouaziz R, Kalleh S, Gouletta B	2009	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Application	N/A	N/A	No	N/A	repudiation	N/A	N/A	SI*, Secure Tropos	None	All	N/A	SERENITY	
21	A pattern-driven security advisor for service-oriented architectures	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2009	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Application	N/A	Yes	Yes	CIA + Authorization	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Analysis, Design	N/A	Web Services	
22	A pattern-driven security process for SOA applications	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2008	Proceedings of the ACM Symposium on Applied Computing			Application	N/A	Yes	Yes	Confidentiality, Integrity	N/A	N/A	UML-like	Model driven, MDA	Example	Analysis, Design, Implementation	N/A		
23	A process model design and tool support for information assets access control using security patterns	Rajeev J, Lakshmi R, Kamoun S	2011	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Application	RBAC	N/A	Yes	Confidentiality		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Requirements analysis, design and implementation	Yes, but unclear	N/A	
24	A qualitative analysis of software security patterns	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2006	Computers and Security	25	5	Analysis			No	Availability	Unclear	N/A	UML	Unclear	Example	Analysis	N/A	N/A	
25	A security engineering process for systems of systems using security patterns	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2014	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Development methodology	N/A	Yes	Yes	Unclear	N/A	N/A	SPT, UML	N/A	N/A	Modeling		N/A	
26	A security pattern-driven approach toward the automation of risk treatment in business processes	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2013	Advances in Intelligent Systems and Computing	18	420	Specification	N/A	No	No	Integrity, confidentiality, non-repudiation	Yes in ontology but a little	Yes (attribute and forces)	Proposed template	OPBUS framework	Example	Business process modeling	OPBUS framework extension	Unclear	
27	A Security Reference Architecture for cloud systems	Fernandez EB, Monge R	2014	ACM International Conference Proceeding Series			Application	N/A	Yes	Yes	Unclear	Abuse patterns and in malware	N/A	UML	Unclear	Example	Requirements analysis, design and implementation	N/A	Cloud	
28	A semantic based certification and access control approach using security patterns on SEAGENT	Talasila P, Tugilar T, Choudhury S	2008	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Application	N/A	N/A	N/A	Confidentiality, integrity, availability	N/A	N/A	N/A	Secure Tropos, model driven design	Case study	Design	Multi-agent systems (MAS)		
29	A study of security architectural patterns	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2006	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Analysis	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	UML class diagram	N/A	N/A	Any	N/A	N/A	
30	A survey of security solutions for distributed publish/subscribe systems	Uzunov A.V.	2016	Computers and Security	61		Survey			N/A			N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Design	N/A		
31	A taxonomy for assessing security in business process modelling	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2013	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Classification, Catalog, Map	SRP1-5	N/A	N/A	Confidentiality, integrity, availability	These assets are not covered	N/A	BPMN	N/A	Example	Business process modeling	N/A	N/A	
32	A tool for managing evolving security requirements	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2012	Lecture Notes in Business Information Processing	31	100	Application	Trusted path	N/A	N/A	N/A	Abuse the situation	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Requirements engineering, analysis		N/A	
33	A UML-based methodology for secure systems: The design stage	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2005	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Development methodology	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Relate attacks to use cases	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Any	N/A	N/A	
34	Abstract security patterns	Fernandez EB, Monge R	2008	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Classification, Catalog, Map	N/A	N/A	N/A	Integrity, confidentiality, non-repudiation	(Threat)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Any	N/A	N/A	
35	Abstract security patterns for requirements specification and analysis of secure systems	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2014	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Classification, Catalog, Map	N/A	N/A	N/A	Integrity, confidentiality, non-repudiation	Threat (and regulation)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Requirements engineering, analysis		N/A	
36	Achieving socio-technical confidentiality using security pattern in smart homes	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2008	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Empirical and case study	N/A	N/A	Combination of patterns	Integrity, confidentiality, non-repudiation	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Design, deployment	N/A	Smart home	
37	An analysis of the security patterns landscape	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2007	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Survey	N/A	N/A	N/A	Integrity, confidentiality, non-repudiation	N/A	N/A	Document	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
38	An approach for security patterns application in component based models	Bouaziz R, Kalleh S, Gouletta B	2014	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Application	RBAC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	UML, ATL	N/A	Design, implementation	Paypross suite tool, ATL	N/A		
39	An approach to model-based development of secure and reliable systems	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2011	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Development methodology	Authorization, RBAC	N/A	N/A	Confidentiality, integrity, availability	Threats, misuses	N/A	UML	MDA, model driven	N/A	Any	N/A	N/A	
40	An architecture for secure ambient intelligence environments	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2009	Advances in Soft Computing			Development methodology	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Development-time, run-time		N/A	
41	An architecture-centric approach to detecting security patterns in software	Bunke M, Sohr K	2011	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Detection	Single Access Point	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Maintenance, evolution		N/A	
42	An aspect-oriented approach for software security hardening: From design to implementation	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2009	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Application	Secure Connection	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	UML, OCL	N/A	Case study, experiment	Design, implementation		N/A	
43	An aspect-oriented approach for the systematic security hardening of code	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2008	Computers and Security	27	4243	Application	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	(Vulnerability and attack)	N/A	N/A	N/A	Any	Case study, experiment	Implementation	AspectC++	N/A
44	An aspect-oriented approach to relating security requirements and access control	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2012	CEUR Workshop Proceedings	855		Application	RBAC	N/A	No N/A	Confidentiality -> Integrity	N/A	N/A	Problem Frame	N/A	Requirements engineering		N/A	N/A	
45	An attack scenario based approach for software security testing at design stage	He K, Fang Z, Li X	2008	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Verification				Confidentiality	Threats, misuses	N/A	N/A	N/A	Any	Design	N/A	N/A	
46	An engineering process for security patterns application in component based models	Bouaziz R, Kalleh S, Gouletta B	2013	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Development methodology	RBAC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	UML	SCRIP	Example	Design, implementation	ATL	N/A	
47	An experience report of improving business process compliance using security risk-oriented patterns	Rajeev J, Lakshmi R, Kamoun S	2015	Lecture Notes in Business Information Processing	235		Empirical and case study	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	UML	BPM	Case Study		N/A	BPM	
48	An exploratory comparison of security patterns and tactics to harden systems	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2014	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Analysis	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Requirements engineering, analysis	N/A	N/A	
49	An ontological interface for software developers to select security patterns	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2008	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)			Selection	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	OWL	N/A	N/A	design	N/A	N/A	
50	An ontology-based approach to security pattern selection	Guan H, Yang H, Wang J	2016	International Journal of Automation and Computing	13	2	Selection	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	STRIDE	N/A	OWL	N/A	N/A	Architecture, design	security pattern search engine	N/A	
51	An operational model and language support for securing XML documents	Heung G-H, Chang T-H	2004	Computers and Security	23	6	Application	N/A	N/A	N/A	Confidentiality	information disclosure	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	operation	N/A	XML	
52	Analysis of application of security patterns to build secure systems	Ali A, Alotaibi A, Alotaibi A	2011	Lecture Notes in Business Information Processing	31	100	Survey	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
53	Analyzing and enforcing security mechanisms on requirements specifications	Li T, Hanif M, Wajid M	2015	Journal of the Software Engineering Association for Information Systems (SEAS)	9013		Analysis	VPN	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A								

54	Applicability of security patterns		2010			Analysis	secure pipes and filters etc.	N/A	N/A	N/A									
55	Applying information retrieval techniques for security requirements verification based on security patterns	Changheleesh C., Przemyslaw N.	2016		1	Verification	reference monitor	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	UML use case description	N/A	Example	Design	N/A	N/A	
56	Applying security patterns for component based applications using UML profile	Bouaziz R., Coulette B.	2012			Application	active replication	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	UML profile	N/A	Case study	Design	N/A	N/A	
57	Architectural risk analysis of software systems based on security patterns	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2008		5	3	Verification	多数	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	risk assessment	N/A	risk assessment	Test?	N/A	N/A	
58	ASE: A comprehensive pattern-driven security methodology for distributed systems	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2015		41		Development methodology		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A example	analysis and design	N/A	distributed systems	
59	Attack surface reduction for web services based on authorization patterns	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2014			Application	RBAC, ABAC	None	No	Not Specified	None	Num. of Attack surfaces	UML	None	Case Study	Design	None	Web apps	
60	Automated security service virtualization for the identity management in Web Service based systems	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2011			Application	identification and authentication	None	No	Not Specified	None	None	SOA	Example	Design	None	SOA		
61	Automated verification of security pattern compositions	Dong J., Ping T., Zhao Y.	2010		52	3	Specification	None	No	Not Specified	None	None	COS (a process algebra)	None	Case Studies	Design	Not specified		
62	Behavioral singletons to consistently handle global states of security patterns	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2012			Application	singleton	inconsistency	No	Not Specified	None	None	UML	SPACE	Example	Design	Not specified		
63	Best-practice patterns and tool support for configuring secure web services messaging	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2004			Application	None	None	No	CIA	None	None	XML	None	None	Requirements Analysis	Web Services		
64	Building a security reference architecture for cloud systems	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2016		21	2	Development methodology	Yes, misuse to security	Not Specified	None	None	None	UML	None	argumentation	Design	Cloud		
65	Building high assurance secure applications using security patterns for capability-based patterns	Rimba P.	2013			Development methodology	Secure Logger	None	No	Not Specified	None	None	Not Specified	None	None	Design and Implementation	SAM modeling tool, SPIN	Not specified	
66	Building secure systems: From threats to security patterns	Fernandez E.B., Mujica S.	2011			Development methodology	None	None	yes	Not Specified	None	None	UML	None	None	None	Not specified		
67	Challenges for a formal framework for patterns	Bayley I.	2014			Analysis	None	Yes	Not Specified	None	None	None	Formals such as Z notation	None	None	Design	None	Not specified	
68	Characterizations and boundaries of security requirements patterns	Slavin R., Shen H., Niu J.	2012			Specification	None	No	Not Specified	None	None	None	Form	None	None	Requirements	None	Not specified	
69	Classifying security patterns	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2008			Classification, Catalog, Map	None	Yes	Not Specified	None	None	None	UML	None	None	Design	None	Not specified	
70	Composing Patterns to Construct Secure Systems	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2015			Verification	None	No	Not Specified	None	None	None	Service Access Model (SAM)	None	Case study	Design, Test	None	Not specified	
71	Conformance checking of single access point pattern in JAAS using codecharts	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2015			Specification	Single Access point pattern (SAP)	None	No	Not Specified	None	None	Example	Design, Implementation	TTP Toolkit verifier	Not specified			
72	Connecting security requirements analysis and secure design using patterns and UMLsec	Schmidt H., Jürgens J.	2011			Development methodology	UMLsec	y	Ci	None	No	UML	N/A	case study	analysis and architecture design	UMLsec	N/A		
73	Context-aware Security@run.time deployment	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2015			Application	None	no	no	no	no	Formal + XML expression	case study	case study	analysis and architecture design	UMLsec	N/A		
74	C-SCRIP: Collaborative security pattern integration process	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2015		10	1	Development methodology	N/A	N/A	no	N/A	N/A	UML profiles	MDA-based	no	the whole process	code generation support	ex. CCM, EJB	
75	Dealing with security requirements for socio-technical systems: A holistic approach	Li T., Horkoff J.	2014			Development methodology	None	No	no	CIA	No	no	goal modeling	Goal oriented	case study (smart grid)	analysis	original prototype tool	N/A	
76	Defining re-usable composite aspect patterns: An FPAF based approach	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2008		5333	Development methodology	None	N/A	Yes (composition)	Confidentiality, integrity	Password guessing	OCL constraints	Example	Analysis, design	Analysis, design	Analysis, design	Analysis, design	N/A	
77	Defining security architectural patterns based on viewpoints	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2007			Specification	N/A	N/A	no	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	no	no	no	N/A
78	Defining viewpoints for security architectural patterns	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2006			Specification	N/A	N/A	no	N/A	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	no	N/A
79	Designing secure SCADA systems using security patterns	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2010			Development methodology	None	no	all	None	no	no	UML	original	no	analysis and design	no	SCADA System	
80	Developing a security patterns repository for secure applications design	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2006			Knowledge bases and repository	None	no	no	no	N/A	template, structured	N/A	not yet	design and implementation	no	N/A		
81	Development of applications based on security patterns	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2009			not mentioned	not mentioned	no	not mentioned	not mentioned	no	XML	Not mentioned	implementation	API	implementation	API	implementation	
82	Do security patterns really help designers?	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2015		1	Empirical and case study	N/A	yes	depending on the patterns	depending on the patterns	depending on the patterns	UML	N/A	yes	design	design	design	N/A	
83	Does organizing security patterns focus architectural choices?	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2012			Empirical and case study	N/A	yes	CIA	N/A	no	UML	N/A	yes	design	design	design	N/A	
84	Early security patterns: A collection of constraints to describe regulatory security requirements	Gandhi R.A., Rahman M.	2012			Specification	N/A	N/A	no	validation using visualization	N/A	N/A	formal modeling	N/A	not yet	design	Alloy	N/A	
85	Effective security impact analysis with patterns for software enhancement	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2011			Verification	anti CSRF pattern	yes	any	no	no	no	N/A	case study (iTrust)	design	design	design	N/A	
86	Elements of application security in the cloud computing environment	Mathew G.	2012			Application	None	no	Confidentiality	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Design	N/A	N/A	
87	Eliciting security requirements through misuse activities	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2008			Verification	None	Yes	illegal money transferring	Yes	Yes	N/A	UML	methodology	N/A	Requirements, Analysis	N/A	N/A	
88	Embedding security patterns into a domain model	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2009			Development methodology	Authorization pattern	N/A	no	Confidentiality	N/A	N/A	UML	N/A	N/A	Requirements, Analysis	N/A	N/A	
89	Enforcing a security pattern in stakeholder goal model	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2008			Application	RBAC (as an example)	N/A	no	Confidentiality	N/A	N/A	i*	i* base method	N/A	requirement	i* + manual	N/A	
90	Enforcing security in smart homes using security patterns	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2009		3	2	Empirical and case study	Authorization	N/A	no	Confidentiality	N/A	UML	N/A	N/A	Design and Implementation	N/A	KAQML(Web service)	
91	Engineering Security into Distributed Systems: A Survey of Methodologies	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2012		18	20	Survey	N/A	N/A	no	Confidentiality, integrity and availability	Yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	development	N/A	N/A	
92	Enhancing model driven security through pattern refinement techniques	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2013			Development methodology	non-repudiation	N/A	no	Confidentiality	N/A	N/A	UML	MDD	N/A	Design	yes	Web services	
93	Enterprise security requirements construction from ESRM grammar based on security patterns	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2007			Application	Security pattern全部	N/A	no	Confidentiality, integrity, availability	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	y (case study)	requirement	N/A	N/A	
94	Enterprise security pattern: A model-driven architecture instance	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2014		36	4	Application	secure SaaS	N/A	yes	Confidentiality	Yes	N/A	digagram	MDD	N/A	development	N/A	Cloud
95	Enterprise security pattern: A new type of security pattern	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2014		7	11	Development methodology	None	no	Confidentiality, integrity and availability	no	N/A	digagram	MDD	N/A	development	N/A	EA	
96	Evaluating the implications of attack and security patterns with premonitors	Fally S., Parkin S., Lyle J.	2014			Analysis	Context Policy Management	yes	yes	Confidentiality, Accountability	yes	N/A	diagram, KAOS	CAIRIS	Example (webinos)	Design	CAIRIS tool	N/A	
97	Evaluation of the Pattern-based method for Secure Development (PBSD) A controlled experiment	Alamri A., Shuaib P.	2012		54	9	Development methodology	RBAC	N/A	no	Confidentiality	N/A	UML+OCL	N/A	Design	Design	Security Modeling Tool (SMT)	DBMS	
98	Evaluation of web application security risks and secure design patterns	Dalai A.K., Jena S.K.	2011			Classification, Catalog, Map	None	N/A	no	Confidentiality, integrity, availability	yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	design, analysis	N/A	N/A	
99	Evolution of the MTA architecture: The impact of security	Hafiz M., Johnson R.E.	2008		38	15	Empirical and case study	N/A	no	Confidentiality/availability	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	design	N/A	N/A	
100	Exploring information security issues in public sector inter-organizational collaboration	Van Veenendaal A.F., Ruyter M.	2011			Empirical and case study	N/A	no	Confidentiality	N/A	N/A	N/A	UML	N/A	N/A	design, analysis	N/A	N/A	
101	Extended software architecture based on security patterns	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2010		21	2	Application	N/A	no	Confidentiality	N/A	N/A	UML	N/A	y (case study)	design	N/A	Java	
102	Extensible security patterns	Robinson P.	2007			Specification	N/A	N/A	no	N/A	N/A	N/A	formal modeling	N/A	no	no	no	no	
103	Facilitating the use of TPM technologies using the serenity framework	Muñoz A., Maña A.	2011			Development methodology	N/A	no	N/A	no	N/A	N/A	development using TPM	no	no	development and at run time	no	TPM	
104	Finding security bugs in web applications using a catalog of access control patterns	Near J.P., Jackson D.	2016			Verification	as pattern violations	no	N/A	as pattern violations	N/A	N/A	formal modeling for alloy	N/A	Yes	static check	Security Pattern Checker	Ruby	
105	Framework for information security standards storage and retrieval using security patterns	Ruanjide P., Thompson R.	2013			Selection	N/A	Yes	N/A	no	N/A	structured	N/A	Yes	?	Yes	?	?	
106	From security patterns to implementation using Petri nets	Horvath V., Dirges T.	2008			Specification	N/A	no	N/A	no	N/A	N/A	petri nets	model driven dev.	no	design-implementation	Yes	multi-agent system	
107	Growing a pattern language (for security)	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2012			Classification, Catalog, Map	None	no	Yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	Hierarchical Scheme	N/A	no	N/A	no	N/A	
108	Identification and implementation of authentication and authorization patterns in the spring security framework	Wang X., Yousang Jeong, Yousang Jeong	2012			Application	None	no	N/A	no	no	no	UML, XML	spring security	no	design, implementation	Yes	spring framework	

109	Identifying and implementing security patterns for a dependable security case - From security patterns to D-cases	Patu V., Yamamoto S.	2013	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Dependable Systems and Networks (DSN 2013)			Detection	no	no	yes		yes	no	no	D-Case diagram	no	no	equipment, design, implementation	no	no
110	Implementation support of security design patterns using test templates		2016	Information (Switzerland)	7	2	Verification		no	no	N/A	no	no	no	UML, OCL	Yes	Yes	equipment, design, implementation, testing	Yes	no
111	Improving security design patterns with aspect-oriented strategies	Edgar C., Mitropoulos F.	2012	Proceedings of the Annual Southeast Conference			Application		no	no	N/A	no	N/A (for quality of security)	UML	aspect oriented	Yes (modularity)	design, implementation	no	no	
112	Improving the classification of security patterns		2009	Proceedings - International Workshop on Database and Expert Systems Applications (DEXA)			Classification, Catalog, Map		no	Yes	N/A	no	no	UML	no	Yes example	analysis, design	no	no	
113	Integrating security patterns into the electronic invoicing process	Netter M., Pernul G.	2009	Proceedings - International Workshop on Database and Expert Systems Applications (DEXA)			Application		no	Yes		no	no		n/a	no	requirement	no	no	
114	Integrating security patterns with security requirements analysis using contextual goal models	L.T. Houtfluij J., Mylopoulos J.	2014	Lecture Notes in Business Information Processing	197		Application		no	no	integrity, confidentiality	no	no	no	n/a	no => example	requirement	Yes, the tool "MUSBR" is used	no	no
115	Management patterns for network resilience: Design and verification of policy configurations	David Hsu, Joon Seok Lee, Joon Seok Lee	2014	Submissions: Utilizing Design Patterns with Security and Attack Patterns			Specification	High-Voltage Traffic, Challenge	N/A	Yes (conflict among policies)	Availability	DDoS	N/A		N/A	Example	Analysis, Architecture design	N/A	Network policy configuration	
116	Measuring the level of security introduced by security patterns	David Hsu, Joon Seok Lee, Joon Seok Lee	2010	SEI 2010 - 30th International Conference on Availability, Reliability, and Security			Verification		yes	N/A	no			UML	no	no	design	no	no	
117	Model checking security pattern compositions	Dong J., Peng T., Zhao Y.	2007	Proceedings - International Conference on Quality Software			Verification		no	no	n/a	no	no		mode checker	no	design	Yes	no	
118	Model-driven security patterns application based on dependencies among patterns		2010	SEI 2010 - 30th International Conference on Availability, Reliability, and Security			Application		no	no	confidentiality	no	no	UML	n/a	yes	design, implementation	ATL	no	
119	Model-driven security with a system of aspect-oriented security design patterns	Nagao T.M., Kato T., Liu T.	2014	ACM International Conference Proceeding Series			Application	no	no	no	n/a	no	no	UML	n/a	no	design	no	no	
120	Modeling and applying security patterns using contextual goal models	Li T., Mylopoulos J.	2014	CEUR Workshop Proceedings	1157		Application	Authenticator	no	no	n/a	no	no	UML	n/a	no	design, requirement	no	no	
121	Modeling and performance analysis for security aspects	Dai L., Cooper K.	2006	Science of Computer Programming	61	1	Analysis		no	no		no	no		aspect-oriented	yes	design, analysis	Yes, the tool "MUSBR" is used	no	no
122	Modeling design patterns with description logics: A case study	Amari Y., Pail E., Mitropoulos J.	2011	Workshop on Formal Methods in Security and Privacy (FMSP)			Specification		no	no	non-repudiation	no	no		no	yes	design	Protege	no	no
123	Modeling misuse patterns	Fernandez E.B., Vassilakis N., Mitropoulos F.	2009	Proceedings - International Conference on Availability, Reliability, and Security (ARES 2009)			Specification	no	Yes	availability	yes	no	no	Misuse Pattern Templates	no	no	no	no	no	no
124	Modeling secure systems using an agent-oriented approach and security patterns	Mitsuru H., Naoki M., Goudarzi S.	2006	International Journal of Software Engineering and Knowledge Engineering		3	Application		no	yes	integrity, availability, privacy	no	no	Tropos	yes	yes	development, analysis, architecture design	no	no	no
125	Modelling security patterns using NFR analysis	Weiss M.	2006	Applying Security and Software Engineering: Advances and Future Visions			Specification		no	yes		no		Goal-oriented Requirement Language	no	no	requirement, design	no	no	no
126	Moving from requirements to design confronting security issues: A case study	Wang J., Goudarzi S., Koudarzi S.	2009	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Dependable Systems and Networks (DSN 2010)	281	PART 2	Development methodology		no	no	confidentiality, integrity	yes	no	no	no	no	design	no	no	no
127	New Approach Targeting Security Patterns Development and Deployment	Murad A., Chouk H., Baigdar L.	2011	Information Security Journal	20	42465	Application		no	no	no	no	no		experiment	design, development, deployment	AspectJ		no	no
128	On building secure SCADA systems using security patterns	David Hsu, Joon Seok Lee, Joon Seok Lee	2009	ACM International Conference Proceeding Series			Development methodology		no	no	no	yes	no	no	no	no	design	no	no	no
129	On the description of software security patterns	Bunke M.	2014	ACM International Conference Proceeding Series			Specification	no	no	no	no	no	no	natural language	no	no	N/A	no	no	no
130	Organizing security patterns	Wang M., Adamiyati F., Johnson M.	2007	IEEE Software	24	4	Empirical and case study		yes	confidentiality, integrity, availability					no	no	all	no	no	no
131	Pattern qualifications and examples of next-generation agile systems-security strategies	Dove R.	2010	Proceedings - International Conference on Security Technology			Classification, Catalog, Map		no	no	no	no	no		no	no	N/A	no	no	no
132	Pattern-based security requirements derivation from secure tropos models	Brenja A., Matulevicius R.	2015	Lecture Notes in Business Information Processing	235		Analysis		no	no	confidentiality, integrity, availability	yes	no		no	no	no	no	no	no
133	Patterns and pattern diagrams for access control	Fernandez E.B., Pail E., Vassilakis N., Mitropoulos F.	2008	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Dependable Systems and Networks (DSN 2008)	148	1485	Specification		no	yes	no	no	no		no	no	design	no	no	no
134	Patterns for security and privacy in cloud ecosystems	Fernandez E.B., Vassilakis N., Mitropoulos F.	###	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Dependable Systems and Networks (DSN 2010)			Development methodology		N/A	no => partially yes	confidentiality and integrity	no	N/A	UML	N/A	? No	Design	N/A	N/A (in cloud-based ecosystem)	
135	Patterns transform architectures	Wang M., Adamiyati F., Johnson M.	###	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Dependable Systems and Networks (DSN 2010)			Application	security pattern	no	no	confidentiality, availability, integrity	yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	no	development and at run time	N/A	N/A	
136	Practical policy patterns	Thomsen D.	###	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Dependable Systems and Networks (DSN 2010)			Analysis	access control	N/A	no	N/A	no	N/A	N/A	N/A	no	design	N/A	N/A	
137	Preliminary evaluation of a software security learning environment	Hazeyama A., Saito M.	###	Studies in Computational Intelligence	578		Knowledge base and repository	N/A	Attack patterns	Yes	N/A	Vulnerability	N/A	N/A	N/A	no	Analysis, design	Knowledge base	N/A	
138	Preventing and unifying threats in cyberphysical systems	Fernandez E.B.	###	Proceedings of IEEE International Symposium on High Assurance Systems Engineering (HASE)	258	258	Analysis	Thread model	threat	no	Not specified	None	N/A	N/A	N/A	no	N/A	N/A	N/A	
139	Privacy patterns for online interactions	Fernandez E.B.	###	SEI 2010 - 30th International Conference on Availability, Reliability, and Security			Analysis		N/A	no	confidentiality, availability, integrity	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	no	N/A	N/A	N/A	
140	Problem-oriented security patterns for requirements engineering	Alshabrah A., Heisel M.	###	ACM International Conference Proceeding Series			Application	N/A	problem pattern	no	Not specified	no	N/A	UML	n/a	no	Design	N/A	N/A	
141	Quantitative evaluation of systems with security patterns using a fuzzy approach	Wang J., Goudarzi S., Koudarzi S.	###	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Dependable Systems and Networks (DSN 2010)	281	281	Verification		attack pattern (STRIDE)	no	confidentiality, availability, integrity	no		Fuzzy methodology	N/A	N/A	STRIDE examination	N/A	N/A	N/A
142	Refining pattern-based reference model for electronic invoices by incorporating threats	Hafner M., Brou R.	###	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Dependable Systems and Networks (DSN 2010)	213	213	Application	Web-services Unclear	no	no	no	no	N/A		no	no	N/A	N/A	N/A (Web Service)	
143	Refining the pattern-based reference model for electronic invoices by incorporating threats	Wang J., Goudarzi S., Koudarzi S.	###	SEI 2010 - 30th International Conference on Availability, Reliability, and Security			Development methodology		misuse	no	no?	N/A	N/A	UML	N/A	no	Analysis	N/A	N/A	
144	Reusable formal models for secure software architectures	Hafner M., Brou R.	###	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Dependable Systems and Networks (DSN 2010)			Specification		no	no	accountability	no	N/A	formal modeling	N/A	no	analysis<+designer>	N/A	N/A	
145	Revisiting architectural tactics for security	Fernandez E.B., Vassilakis N., Mitropoulos F.	###	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Dependable Systems and Networks (DSN 2010)	9278		Classification, Catalog, Map	Context: Standard Authorizer	no	no	Confidentiality, integrity	no	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	design	N/A	N/A	
146	SCRISTUDIO: A security pattern integration tool	Bouaziz R., Kamouni S.	###	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Dependable Systems and Networks (DSN 2010)			Development methodology	N/A	N/A	no	N/A	no	no	UML	N/A	N/A	design, coding	N/A	N/A	
147	SecMER: A tool to gain control of security requirements evolution	Wang J., Goudarzi S., Koudarzi S.	2011	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Dependable Systems and Networks (DSN 2011)	944	944	Verification	N/A	N/A	N/A	Not specified (Confidentiality)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	no	requirement analysis	Yes	N/A	
148	SecMER: An extensible framework for the realization of secure inter-organizational workflows	Hafner M., Brou R.	2006	Internet Research	16	5	Development methodology		None	None	no	no	no	UML	MDA	Yes (case study)	Design, realization	none	Web Services	
149	Secure component based applications through security patterns	Bouaziz R., Couleir B.	2012	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Dependable Systems and Networks (DSN 2012)			Application	Authentication pattern, RBAC	N/A	N/A	integrity and confidentiality	N/A	N/A	UML	MDD + CBSE	case study	Design	N/A	N/A	
150	Secure engineering and modelling of a metering devices system	Wang J., Goudarzi S., Koudarzi S.	2013	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Dependable Systems and Networks (DSN 2013)			Empirical and case study	N/A	N/A	Yes	Confidentiality, integrity, availability	N/A	N/A	UML		case study	analysis, design	Yes	Not specified	
151	Securing analysis patterns	Fernandez E.B., Yuan X.	2007	Proceedings of the Annual Southeast Conference	2007		Development methodology		No	No	Integrity	N/A	N/A	UML	Not specified	N/A	no	Not specified	N/A	N/A
152	Securing distributed systems using patterns: A survey	Fernandez E.B., Yuan X.	2012	Computers and Security	31	5	Survey		N/A	No	CIA	N/A	Y?	Not specified	Not specified	No	Not specified	N/A	Not specified	
153	Security and reliability with better patterns: An architecture approach for networked system addition with security patterns	Sohn J.-W., Ryojo J.	2015	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Availability, Reliability, and Security (ARES 2015)			Development methodology	intercepting validator		N/A	availability			text	N/A	Yes (case study)	design, implementation	N/A	PHP	
154	Security and dependability in ambient intelligence scenarios: The communication prototype	Fernandez E.B., Vassilakis N., Mitropoulos F.	2009	SEI 2010 - 30th International Conference on Availability, Reliability, and Security	ISAS		Development methodology		N/A	N/A	Confidentiality, integrity, availability	denying services	N/A	UML	SERENITY approach	N/A	Analysis, design	SERENITY model	N/A	N/A
155	Security design patterns: Survey and evaluation	Fernandez E.B., Vassilakis N., Mitropoulos F.	2007	Journal Conference on Electrical and Computer Engineering			Survey		N/A	Yes	Integrity	N/A		UML	N/A	Yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	
156	Security modeling for service-oriented systems using security pattern refinement approach	Fernandez E.B., Vassilakis N., Mitropoulos F.	2014	Software and Systems Modeling	13	2	Development methodology		None	yes	Confidentiality, integrity and availability	no	no	UML	Requirement analysis, design	yes(case study)	design	no	Web Services	
157	Security pattern evaluation	Duncan I., McQuinn-Hughes J.D.	2014	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Availability, Reliability, and Security (ARES 2014)			Analysis	N/A	N/A	Yes	Confidentiality	N/A	N/A	Not specified		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
158	Security Pattern Lattice: A formal model to organize Security Patterns	Samuel A., Pail E., Saito M., Saito M.	2008	Proceedings - International Workshop on Database and Expert Systems Applications (DEXA)			Specification		N/A	N/A	Yes	integrity, confidentiality	N/A	N/A	Text, formula	Not-specified SPL	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
159	Security pattern mining: Systematic review and proposal	Samuel A., Pail E., Saito M., Saito M.	2011	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Availability, Reliability, and Security (ARES 2011)			Survey	N/A	N/A	N/A	Confidentiality, integrity, availability	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	no	architecture design	N/A	N/A	
160	Security patterns and a methodology to apply them	Fernandez E.B.	2009	Advances in Information Security	45		Development methodology		N/A	no	confidentiality, integrity and availability	N/A	N/A	Not specified		No	no	none	no	no
161	Security patterns and requirements for internet-based applications	Fernandez E.B.	2006	Internet Research	16	5	Development methodology		denial-of-service	Yes	all	not specified	no	UML	Not specified	yes(case study)	design	none	no	no
162	Security patterns and secure systems design	Fernandez E.B.	2007	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Availability, Reliability, and Security (ARES 2007)			Development methodology	Product Filter Firewall Pattern	N/A	Yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	text	Not specified	N/A	Design	none	N/A	
163	Security patterns for capturing encryption-based access control to sensor data	Fernandez E.B., Vassilakis N., Mitropoulos F.	2008	Proceedings - 10th IEEE International Conference on Availability, Reliability, and Security (ARES 2008)			Application		N/A	Yes	Confidentiality	N/A	N/A		N/A	Analysis, design	N/A	Wireless sensors		

164	Security patterns used agent-oriented software engineering: A complementary solution for developing secure information systems	Morabito R., Botta W., Gargano R.	2005			Specification			Yes	availability?	N/A	N/A	UML?	N/A	N/A	Implementation	N/A	N/A	
165	Security patterns modeling and formalization for pattern-based development of secure software systems	Harold B., Gargano S., Fuchs A.	2016	12	2	Verification			N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Formula	N/A	N/A	Algorithm => design	N/A	N/A	
166	Security patterns: A method for constructing secure and efficient inter-company coordination systems	Yashika K., Roshni S., Fakhri A.	2004			Development methodology	N/A	N/A	Yes	availability?	N/A	N/A	text	MDA	case study	development	N/A	N/A	
167	Security patterns: Comparing modeling approaches		2010			Specification													
168	Security requirements specification in service-oriented business process management	Morad M., Thomas J., Morad E.	2009			Application			N/A	Confidentiality, integrity	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Process management	N/A		
169	Security solution themes and security patterns for authorization in distributed, collaborative systems	Almeida A., Gonzalez E.B., Salazar C.	2015	55		Computers and Security			Yes	authorization	N/A	N/A	UML	MDA	case study	design	N/A	Distributed system	
170	Selecting proper security patterns using text classification	Neethirajagan S.M.H., Jadhav S.	2009			Selection	N/A	N/A	Yes(classification)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Experiment	design	automatic method	N/A	
171	SERENITY Aware System Development Process	Sanchez-Gil F., Mañá A.	2009	45		Development methodology	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	model-driven	N/A	Design, implementation	SERENITY Run-time Framework	N/A
172	SERENITY pattern-based software development life-cycle	Sanchez-Gil F., Mañá A.	2008			Development methodology	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	model-driven	N/A	Whole development life-cycle	Serenity Methodology	N/A
173	Software engineering techniques applied to Aml: Security patterns	Sanchez-Gil F., Mañá A.	2006			Development methodology	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	model-driven	Case study	Implementation	SERENITY Run-time Framework	N/A
174	Standardizing business application security assessments with pattern-driven audit automation	Tryfonas T., Kearney B.	2008	30	4	Application			Yes (Fig. 1)	N/A	N/A	N/A	UML	N/A	N/A	Implementation	audit automation	N/A	
175	Structural analysis of the check point pattern	Abdellatif A.A., Eddah A.H., Tahar M.	2014			Analysis			Yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	Codecharts	N/A	N/A	Analysis or Design	use Test-Tier Programming kit	N/A	
176	Supporting security sensitive architecture design	Baker M.A., Wang X., Gordon L.	2005			Application			Yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	case study	architecture	N/A	N/A
177	Survey on body of knowledge regarding software security	Hazeyama A.	2012			Survey	none(包括)	none(包括)	Yes	N/A	XSS, SQLInjection	N/A	UML	!	N/A	none	N/A	N/A	
178	Technical patterns for long term trusted archiving	Rezaei S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S.	2009			Classification, Catalog, Map	generic solution patterns	no	Yes	integrity and authenticity	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	case study	Analysis	N/A	N/A
179	TESEM A tool for verifying security design pattern applications by model testing		2015			Verification	Security Requirement patterns	一般的	No	N/A	N/A	N/A	OCL, UML	N/A	experiment(exercise)	Requirement or architecture	model testing tool	N/A	
180	The credentials pattern	Morad M., Thomas J., Morad E.B.	2006			Application	credentials patterns	No	No	availability	N/A	N/A	UML	N/A	Example	architecture	N/A	N/A	
181	The history-based authentication pattern	Alkassayer A., Allen W.H.	2014			Application	Authentication patterns	None	Yes	Confidentiality, integrity, authenticity	N/A	N/A	UML	N/A	Example	Operation and maintenance	N/A	N/A	
182	The ISDF framework: Integrating security patterns and best practices	Alkassayer A., Allen W.H.	2009	36		Development methodology			Yes	Confidentiality, integrity	N/A	N/A	ISDF	N/A	Example	Requirement, authentication, representation	N/A	N/A	
183	The nature of order: From security patterns to a pattern language	Helfic M., Adamczyk P.	2012			Classification, Catalog, Map	none(包括)		Yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	Pattern Language	N/A	N/A	collection of operations and scenarios	N/A	N/A	
184	The practical application of a process for eliciting and designing security in web service systems	Almeida A., Gonzalez E.B., Salazar C.	2009	51	12	Information and Software Technology	Empirical and case study	none(包括)	Yes	Confidentiality, integrity	N/A	N/A	PWSSecBased on UML	N/A	case study	architecture	support to PWSSec process	N/A	
185	The security survey and analysis on supervisory control and data acquisition communication	Rezaei S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S.	2014	10	10	Journal of Computer Science	classification pattern for SCADA control		No	Confidentiality, integrity, availability	N/A	N/A	UML	SCADA security	N/A	Implementation	N/A	SCADA System	
186	The Security Twin Peaks		2011			Development methodology	security twin peaks		Yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	security twin peaks	discussion	architecture	N/A	N/A	
187	Thinking towards a pattern language for predicate-based encryption crypto-systems	De Waghart H., Dierckx J.	2012			Application		N/A	Yes	Unclear	N/A	N/A	N/A	Unclear	Critique	Unclear	N/A	Unclear	
188	Threat and countermeasure patterns for cloud computing	Shah T., Bhagwat V., Kanyan N.	2014			Application	RBAC, etc., Spoofing, etc.	Yes	Unclear	Unclear (Threat pattern)	N/A	N/A	UML	Unclear	Example	Unclear	N/A	Cloud	
189	Threat assessment in the cloud environment - A quantitative approach for security pattern selection	Rezaei S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S.	2016			Selection		N/A	No	Confidentiality, integrity and availability	STRIDE	N/A	N/A	Unclear	Case study	Unclear	N/A	Cloud	
190	Towards a better integration of patterns in secure component-based systems design	Rezaei S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S.	2011			Application		N/A	No	Unclear (N/A)	N/A	N/A	UML profile	N/A	Example	Unclear	N/A	Component-based software	
191	Towards a classification framework for security patterns	Blackwell C.	2006			Classification, Catalog, Map	N/A	N/A	Yes	Unclear	N/A	N/A	N/A	Unclear	N/A	Development and operation	N/A	Unclear	
192	Towards a conceptual framework for security patterns	Blackwell C.	2014			Classification, Catalog, Map	N/A	N/A	No	Confidentiality, integrity and availability	N/A	N/A	N/A	Unclear	N/A	Unclear	N/A	Unclear	
193	Towards a generic process for security pattern integration	Katayama A., Gargano R., Ruffalo G.	2009			Pattern integration	SSL, TPM	N/A	Yes because of integration	Confidentiality and integrity	N/A	N/A	Formula	Unclear	Example	Unclear	N/A	Unclear	
194	Towards a MOF/QVT-based domain architecture for model driven security	Helfic M., Allen W.H., Gargano R.	2006			Application	RBAC	N/A	Yes as metamodel	Confidentiality and integrity	N/A	N/A	UML	MDA	Example	Unclear	N/A	Unclear	
195	Towards a pattern-based security methodology to build secure information systems	Rezaei S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S.	2011			Development methodology	N/A	N/A	No	Availability	Misuse pattern	N/A	N/A	SPEN	N/A	Entire	N/A	Unclear	
196	Towards compliant reference architectures by finding analogies and overlaps in compliance regulations	Fernandez E.B., Yman D.	2015			Development methodology	Information, vulnerability, integrity	N/A	No	Confidentiality and integrity	N/A	N/A	UML	Unclear	Example	Unclear Development	N/A	Unclear	
197	Towards continuous information security audit	Katayama A., Gargano R., Ruffalo G.	2016	1564		Analysis		N/A	No	Confidentiality, integrity and availability	Yes but a little	N/A	N/A	N/A	Business process modeling	Example	Requirements analysis	N/A	Unclear
198	Towards developing secure software using problem-oriented security patterns	Almeida A., Gonzalez E.B., Salazar C.	2014	8708		Development methodology		N/A	No	Confidentiality, integrity and integrity	N/A	N/A	N/A	Problem frame, UML	Twin peaks model	Example	Requirements	N/A	Unclear
199	Towards precise security patterns	Sanchez-Gil F., Mañá A., Salazar C.	2008			Development methodology	N/A	N/A	No	No	N/A	N/A	UML like	Unclear	Scenario			Unclear	Unclear
200	Usability and security patterns	Fernandez E.B., Salazar C.	2009			Development methodology	Explicit user role for Actual scenarios	None	Yes	Availability, popularity	None	N/A	None	N/A	Experiment	Evaluation	N/A	N/A	
201	Using patterns to understand and compare Web services security products and standards	Fernandez E.B., Salazar C.	2006	2006		Classification, Catalog, Map	N/A	N/A	Yes	Confidentiality, integrity	N/A	N/A	UML	UML modeling	Example	architecture design	N/A	Web Services	
202	Using proven Reference Monitor patterns for security evaluation	Hederman M.R., Schall R.R.	2016	7	2	Verification	TOS subset security pattern	None	Yes	Mandatory Access Control	None	None	None	None	Compliance, Verifiability, Isolation	Trusted Network Interpretation			
203	Using security patterns for modelling security capabilities in grid systems	Aziz B., Blackwell C.	2014			Application		None	Yes	Trustworthiness	None	None	Virtual Organization	Cloud	Evaluate the design space	Virtual Organization Lifecycle		Grid Operating System	
204	Using security patterns to combine security metrics	Rezaei S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S.	2008			Verification		Yes	Yes	Integrity, Confidentiality, Availability	Attack tree analysis can be considered	Security properties of a system	dependency tree			ATM example			
205	Using security patterns to develop secure systems		2010			Development methodology	Misuse pattern	Misuse Activities	Yes	Access Control			UML	Metamodeling					
206	Using security patterns to tailor software process	Rezaei S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S.	2011			Development methodology			Yes	Security (Unclear or no)									
207	Using UML and security patterns to teach secure systems design	Fernandez E.B., Ponzo M.M.	2005			Verification	Rela based access control pattern	None	Yes	None	None	None	UML	UML modeling(N/A)	None	OO design	UML		
208	Validating security design patterns application using model testing		2013			Verification	Rela based access control pattern	None	Yes	Security	None	None	UML and UCL	Test Driven Development	None	Testing	USE	None	
209	Verifying implementation of security design patterns using a test template		2014			Verification	Rela based access control pattern	None	Yes	Security	None	None	UML	Test Driven Development	Test template	Testing	Model-based Testing tool	None	
210	Vulnerability-based security pattern categorization in search of missing patterns	Rezaei S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S.	2014			Classification, Catalog, Map	N/A	N/A	No	Confidentiality, integrity and availability	OWASP vulnerability categorization	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Unclear	N/A	None	
211	Web security patterns for analysis and design	Okubo T., Tanaka H.	2008			Empirical and case study	Abuse pattern	Yes	Yes	N/A	N/A	None	None	None	None	None	None	None	
212	Wireless Information security system via role based access control pattern use case design	Katayama A., Gargano R., Ruffalo G.	2008			Application	RBAC	N/A	N/A	Confidentiality	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Analysis, Design	N/A	N/A	
213	XML context's security patterns language: Description and syntax	Barbosa T.E.M., Wang S.	2007	6	7	Application		None	Yes	Security	None	None	None	None	XML	any XML tool	any platform		
214	A classification methodology for security patterns to help fix software weaknesses	Rezaei S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S.	2017			Classification, Catalog, Map	N/A	N/A					N/A	N/A	Example	Requirements, Analysis, Design	Database	N/A	
215	Exploiting traceability uncertainty between software architectural models and extra-functional needs	Talbot C., Ghali A., Roper A.	2017	125		Analysis	N/A	N/A	N/A	Confidentiality	N/A	N/A	N/A	UML modeling	case study	architecture design	SoETTraceAnalyzer	None	
216	Guiding the Selection of Security Patterns for Real-Time Systems	Rezaei S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S.	2017			Selection	Security design patterns, Firewall pattern	N/A	Yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	UML, MARTE	Case Study(SCADA)	Requirements, Analysis, Design	Pattern Language	N/A	N/A	
217	Addressing Security Challenges in Cloud Computing - A Pattern-Based Approach	Rezaei S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S., Saeedi S.	2017			Development methodology		N/A	Yes	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Requirements, Analysis, Design	N/A	N/A	
218	A methodology of security pattern classification and of attack-defense tree generation	Reginia L., Salva S.	2017			Classification, Catalog, Map		Yes	Yes	Web application attack (CAPRE)	Web application weakness (OWASP)	diagram, tabular	Attack Defense Trees (ADT) based	Web application attack (CAPRE) based	Requirements, Analysis, Design	N/A	N/A		

219	Systematic pattern approach for safety and security co-engineering in the automotive domain		2017			Development methodology	security gateway	N/A	Yes	integrity	STRIDE	None	None		Case study			
220	Pre-validation before exploitation: The case of cybersecurity domain knowledge to reduce software engineers against software vulnerabilities	Nelson T, Dool R, Ferguson M, Rowan A	2017			Knowledge base and repository	N/A	N/A	No	Unclear		None	VAP template	None	Experiment	Software Development Lifecycle	N/A	N/A
221	Model-based design of reusable secure connectors	Shin M, Gurnee M, Pathiranga G	2017	CEUR Workshop Proceedings	2019	Application		N/A	Yes		N/A	Performance comparison	UML		Experiment	Design	N/A	N/A
222	Using data integration for security testing	Salva S, Regania L	2017			Verification			Yes	N/A	DREAD, STRIDE	Review and verification of existing test cases	UML, Attack defence tree form	N/A	Experiment	ADTool	data-store	
223	Supporting secure business process design via security process patterns	Agarwalachari N, Murugadas N, Poth A	2017	Lecture Notes in Business Information Processing	287	Application		N/A	No			Review and verification of existing test cases	UML, Attack defence tree form	N/A	Experiment	Secure Tropos	N/A	
224	Security knowledge representation artifacts for creating secure IT systems	Naz JF, Ajeesh N, Nisha A, Radhak G	2017	Computers and Security	64	Knowledge base and repository			Yes	CI		Review and verification of existing test cases	UML	N/A	example	Requirements, design	No	
225	Anti-spyware security design patterns	Nazki S, Anandharaj, Anandharaj S	2016			Application	Anti-spyware pattern	N/A	Yes	N/A	N/A	Review and verification of existing test cases	UML	N/A	Experiment	Runtime	WEKA	general
226	Framework for engineering complex security requirements patterns	Mazo R, Feltus C	2016			Development methodology	N/A	N/A	Yes	Confidentiality	N/A	Review and verification of existing test cases	UML	N/A	No	Requirements	No	
227	Threat Modeling in Cyber-Physical Systems	Fernandez E.B.	2016			Analysis	No	Threat of service misuse		N/A	N/A	Review and verification of existing test cases	UML OCL	MDD	No	Design, Architecture	No	
228	Secure design patterns for security in smart metering systems	Ur-Rehman O, Zivic N	2016			Application		No	No	N/A	N/A	Review and verification of existing test cases	UML	N/A	No	Design	No	
229	A Metamodel for Security and Privacy Knowledge in Cloud Services		2016			Development methodology			Y	CIA	Cloud	Review and verification of existing test cases	N/A		only case study	ALL	N/A	Cloud
230	Building secure cloud architectures using patterns	Fernandez E.B.	2016			Development methodology			Y	STRIDE		Review and verification of existing test cases	Y		qualitative validation	N/A	N/A	Cloud
231	An analytical study of security patterns	Parisi P, Stivaler S, Krieger G	2016	ACM International Conference Proceeding Series		Classification, Catalog, Misc	N/A	N/A	N/A	CIA		Review and verification of existing test cases	N/A	N/A	all	N/A	N/A	N/A
232	Modeling and security in cloud ecosystems		2016	Future Internet	8	2	Development methodology		None	Yes	unclear	unclear	UML	None	explanation	design?	None	cloud
233	Modeling and analyzing security patterns using high level petri nets	He X., Fu Y.	2016			Verification		None	Yes	Correctness	None	Reachability	Petri net	None	simulation	Design?	PIPE+	Cyber physical systems
234	Towards the integration of security patterns in UML Component-based Applications		2016	CEUR Workshop Proceedings	1693	Development methodology	VPN	None	None	None	None	None	UML, OCL	model-based	Example	Architecture	None	None
235	Model-based real-time evaluation of security patterns: A SCADA system case study		2016			Analysis		N/A	Yes	Security, Realtime	N/A	Execution time	GoF Style	SCADA security	yes(case study)	Analysis, Design	Yes(UML tool)	SCADA System
236	Automatic enforcement of security properties		2016			Application		N/A	Yes	Confidentiality	N/A	N/A			yes(case study)	Analysis, Design	Yes(M2M trans)	Unclear
237	Adaption of integrated secure guide for secure software development lifecycle	Lee K-H, Park Y.B.	2016	International Journal of Security and Its Applications	10	6	Development methodology	N/A	misuse case	N/A	N/A	misuse and threat	N/A	N/A	comparison	All	N/A	N/A
238	Software-security patterns: Degree of maturity	Bunke M.	2015	ACM International Conference Proceeding Series		Analysis		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	All	N/A	N/A	N/A
239	Building the selection of security patterns based on security requirements and pattern classification		2015	ACM International Conference Proceeding Series		Selection		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Example	High level design	SEMO(pattern-repository)	SCADA System
240	Improvement of security patterns strategy for information security audit applications	Almehraz L, Alshaykh M	2015			Knowledge base and repository	N/A		N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	security ontology	N/A	N/A	development	security pattern repository	N/A
241	Building Secure Applications Using Pattern-Based Design Fragments	Renke P, Zhu L, Xu X, Sun G	2015			Application		None	N/A	Confidentiality	attack analysis	N/A	N/A	N/A	case study	analysis and design	Yes	N/A
242	A survey on security patterns		2008	Progress in Informatics	5	Survey	Secure Logger	N/A	Yes	All	N/A	N/A	UML	N/A	All	N/A	N/A	N/A
243	Security patterns for automated continuous auditing	Kearney B, Tryfonas T	2008	Information Security Journal	17	1	Application	many in table1	Yes	accountability	N/A	N/A	UML	N/A	N/A	NO	ERP	